

# Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee

10:00 am, Tuesday, 24 March 2015

## Lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela

Item number	7.5
Report number	
Executive/routine	
Wards	11 – City Centre

### Executive summary

---

The Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee has agreed that a lasting memorial to the late former South African president and anti-apartheid campaigner Nelson Mandela should be established within the Edinburgh St James development. The Committee is requested to determine what form the lasting memorial should take and delegate authority to the Senior Responsible Officer for the St James project and the Director of Economic Development to negotiate and enter into a formal agreement with the developer and to delegate authority in turn as required.

### Links

---

Coalition pledges	<a href="#">P31</a>
Council outcomes	<a href="#">CO13, CO14, CO26</a>
Single Outcome Agreement	<a href="#">SO4</a>

## Lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela

### Recommendations

---

- 1.1 To determine what form the lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela should take. This could include naming a public space after Mandela as well as a tangible memorial such as a plaque; mural; stone bench; or statue/bust/sculpture.
- 1.2 To delegate authority to the Senior Responsible Officer for the St James project and the Director of Economic Development to negotiate and enter into a formal agreement with TIAA Henderson Real Estate regarding the location for the proposed lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela within Edinburgh St James and to delegate authority in turn as required.

### Background

---

- 2.1 Nelson Mandela, the former president of South Africa and a long-term campaigner against that country's system of apartheid, died on 5 December 2013.
- 2.2 Nelson Mandela visited Edinburgh in October 1997 to attend a Commonwealth Heads of Government meeting. During the visit, Nelson Mandela was awarded the Freedom of Edinburgh. There are a number of existing tributes to Nelson Mandela in Edinburgh, including:
  - The Mandela Room in the City Chambers;
  - The Potterrow Mandela Centre at the University of Edinburgh;
  - A plaque outside the City Chambers honouring 46664, a charity founded by Nelson Mandela to campaign against AIDS;
  - A statue on Festival Square, *Woman and Child*, that commemorates Edinburgh's opposition to apartheid in South Africa.
- 2.3 On 12 December 2013, the Lord Provost submitted a motion to the City of Edinburgh Council moving for the Council to explore the creation of "a lasting tribute to Nelson Mandela in order to commemorate his contribution to creating

global multi racial democracy in South Africa and his long association with Edinburgh.” The motion was approved by the Council.

- 2.4 On 4 November 2014, a report was submitted to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee setting out five potential locations for a lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela. A motion to site the lasting memorial within the Edinburgh St James development was carried by the Committee.

## Main report

---

- 3.1 TIAA Henderson Real Estate (TH Real Estate), the developer behind Edinburgh St James, has agreed in principle to the creation of a lasting memorial within the curtilage of the development. An alternative potential location is within the new public realm being created at Picardy Place. However, it will not be clear whether there will be capacity at Picardy Place for a memorial until detailed designs are completed. An agreement will require to be reached with TH Real Estate as to a mutually acceptable location for a memorial. While an agreement over location can be reached once the public realm strategy is completed, with the timescales associated with this development, it could be 2020 before a memorial would be established on site.
- 3.3 Information has been compiled on 15 existing and proposed memorials to Nelson Mandela around the world (see appendix one). These comprise:
- Seven statues/sculptures/busts of Nelson Mandela;
  - Three streets/squares named after Nelson Mandela;
  - Two plaques commemorating visits by Nelson Mandela;
  - Two murals depicting Nelson Mandela;
  - A stone bench engraved with a quotation from Nelson Mandela.
- 3.4 The projected costs of a memorial are highly variable. A plaque, engraved stone bench or mural would likely cost several hundred or thousands of pounds. A life-sized bust would likely cost tens of thousands of pounds. A large statue or sculpture would likely cost hundreds of thousands of pounds. There would be additional costs associated with securing the required consents and installation.
- 3.5 In addition to the upfront costs associated with creating a new physical memorial, there would be ongoing maintenance costs. The Council’s preferred approach is that any new memorials should have an endowment to cover maintenance and repair costs over the life of the memorial.
- 3.6 Naming a new or presently unnamed space after Nelson Mandela would carry only limited capital costs (name-plates, etc). It is noted, however, that the

Council's Policy and Criteria for New Street Names (as amended on 7 August 2014) states that a minimum period of five years should elapse before a street is named after a deceased person, i.e. 5 December 2018. The policy does, however, allow for a street to be named after a deceased person within five years of their death in special circumstances if there is "overwhelming support", given agreement from all ward councillors and final approval from the Development Management Sub Committee. Renaming an existing space would be considerably more complex given that this would require title deeds, etc, to be updated; there is therefore a presumption against doing so in the absence of an exigency.

3.7 The Council could seek external funding for the delivery of the lasting memorial. A number of potential sources of external funding are listed below.

- Open Project Funding: a programme administered by Creative Scotland offering grants of up to £100,000 (in special cases, up to £150,000) for creative projects, including the commissioning of new work of high quality;
- Sharing Heritage: a programme administered by the Heritage Lottery Fund offering grants of up to £10,000 for projects to share heritage, including capital projects;
- Sponsorship: sponsorship could be sought from the private sector;
- Crowdfunding: donations could be sought from members of the public.
- Developer contributions.

3.8 In the event that the Council was to procure a statue/sculpture/bust, mural or other piece of public art, a contest could potentially be staged to identify the best design. This would give members of the public the opportunity to influence the selection of a design.

## Measures of success

---

4.1 The project will aim to deliver a lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela as directed by the Committee at minimal cost to the public.

## Financial impact

---

5.1 The projected financial impact of delivering the lasting memorial to Nelson Mandela will be influenced by the nature of the memorial. The naming of a new or presently unnamed space after Nelson Mandela or the installation of a plaque, engraved stone bench or mural would carry relatively modest costs. The creation of a statue/sculpture/bust would be considerably more expensive (most likely tens of thousands or hundreds of thousands of pounds).

- 5.2 No budget has been identified for the lasting memorial at present.
- 5.3 The Council could potentially seek external funding for the delivery of the lasting memorial.
- 5.4 It is noted that any new pieces of public art will carry ongoing maintenance costs for which funding would also need to be identified over the lifespan of the art.

## **Risk, policy, compliance and governance impact**

---

- 6.1 The major risk identified for this project is an inability to secure sufficient funding to deliver a lasting memorial as directed by the Committee.

## **Equalities impact**

---

- 7.1 There are no identifiable equalities impacts associated with this project.

## **Sustainability impact**

---

- 8.1 The sustainability of any pieces of public art could be enhanced via the use of locally-sourced materials where possible.

## **Consultation and engagement**

---

- 9.1 Consultation has taken place with TIAA Henderson Real Estate, with the project manager for the Edinburgh St James development, and with the Council's Estates Services and Museums and Galleries service areas.

## **Background reading / external references**

---

[Review of Policy and Criteria for New Street Names \(report to the Planning Committee, 7 August 2014\)](#)

[The City of Edinburgh Council, minutes of 12 December 2013](#)

["Memorial to Nelson Mandela" \(report to the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee, 4 November 2014\)](#)

### **Greg Ward**

Director of Economic Development

Contact: Kyle Drummond, Senior Economic Development Officer

E-mail: [kyle.drummond@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:kyle.drummond@edinburgh.gov.uk) | Tel: 0131 528 4849

## Links

---

<b>Coalition pledges</b>	P31 – Maintain our city's reputation as the cultural capital of the world by continuing to support and invest in our cultural infrastructure
<b>Council outcomes</b>	CO13 – Edinburgh delivers high standards in the maintenance of infrastructure and public realm. CO14 – Edinburgh remains an attractive city through the development of high quality buildings and places CO26 – Visibly enhance our city's cultural and sporting future.
<b>Single Outcome Agreement</b>	SO4 – Edinburgh's communities are safer and have improved physical and social fabric
<b>Appendices</b>	1 – Examples of lasting memorials to Nelson Mandela

## **Appendix 1 – Examples of lasting memorials to Nelson Mandela**

### **South Africa**

- a) The National Heritage Council of South Africa unveiled a nine metre high bronze statue of Nelson Mandela on the lawns of the Union Buildings in Pretoria (the South African seat of government) in December 2013. The statue, which cost approximately £440,000, was created by South African sculptors Andre Prinsloo and Ruhan Janse van Vuuren.
- b) The Parliament of South Africa unveiled a two metre high bronze bust of Nelson Mandela next to the steps of the National Assembly in Cape Town (the seat of South Africa's lower house of parliament) in April 2014. The bust, which cost approximately £138,000, was created by South African sculptors Barry Jackson and Xhanti Mpakama.
- c) An eight metre high stainless steel sculpture, *Perceiving Freedom*, was installed on the Sea Point Promenade in Cape Town in November 2014. The sculpture depicts a large pair of Ray-Ban Wayfarer sunglasses facing over Atlantic Ocean towards Robben Island, where Nelson Mandela was incarcerated for 18 years. The sculpture was created by local sculptor Michael Elion with support from the City of Cape Town's Arts and Culture Department. The sculpture was sponsored by Ray-Ban, which has attracted some criticism that the sculpture is advertising. The sculpture is planned to remain in its current position for two years.

### **United Kingdom**

- d) Glasgow City Council installed a bronze bust depicting Nelson Mandela in the foyer of Glasgow City Chambers in October 2014. The sculpture, which cost approximately £20,000, was created by Edinburgh-based sculptor Deidre Nicholls.
- e) Manchester City Council has expressed an interest in erecting a statue in memory of Nelson Mandela. In December 2013, the Council began a public consultation on the preferred form of statue: a traditional plinth statue or a statue similar to Manchester's Alan Turing Memorial, which is a bronze statue depicting Turing seated on a bench that members of the public are also able to sit on. The consultation also requested views on the most appropriate location for the statue.
- f) Leicester City Council has also announced an interest in erecting a bronze statue of Nelson Mandela. In July 2014, the Council began a fundraising campaign aimed at securing £50,000 through donations and grants by July 2016. The Council would supply land and a plinth. The Council has created a charitable vehicle, the Nelson Mandela Community Programme, to spearhead fundraising.

## **United States of America**

- g) The Los Angeles City Council and the Wende Museum unveiled a mural of Nelson Mandela on the city's Berlin Wall Monument in July 2014. The mural was the work of Los Angeles-based muralist Kent Twitchell. The Los Angeles City Council also declared 18 July 2014 to be "Nelson Mandela Day".
- h) In the Bay Area of California, the funeral parlours Skylawn Funeral Home and Memorial Park and Chapel of the Chimes partnered with the Nelson Mandela Foundation and the Oakland chapter of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People to stage a competition to identify a design for a monument to Nelson Mandela. The monument will be made of granite and/or bronze and will be located in the Skylawn Memorial Park in San Mateo, California. The contest received around 200 entries, with the winner announced as Ohio-based architect Brian Sell, who proposed a five metre high abstract sculpture representing Nelson Mandela's prison cell. The monument is due to be unveiled in late 2015.
- i) The government of Los Angeles County installed a plaque to Nelson Mandela in the Los Angeles Memorial Coliseum Court of Honor in May 2014. Nelson Mandela spoke at the Coliseum during a visit to Los Angeles in June 1990.
- j) Baseball team the New York Yankees installed a plaque to Nelson Mandela at Monument Park – an open air museum at Yankee Stadium that commemorates both the history of the baseball team and public figures – in April 2014. Nelson Mandela visited the original Yankee Stadium while visiting New York in June 1990.
- k) The Illinois Department of Transport renamed a stretch of Cicero Avenue in Chicago "Mandela Road" in July 2014.
- l) The city council of Alice, Texas installed a stone bench in tribute to Nelson Mandela in the Charles E. Brazzell Sr. Park in October 2014. The bench, which is engraved with a quote from Nelson Mandela, occupies the former site of an early African American church. The costs of the bench were contributed by a local funeral parlour.

## **Canada**

- m) The city council of Ottawa named a previously unnamed area to the front of the Ottawa City Hall's Heritage Building the "Nelson Mandela Square" in July 2014. The square hosts the Canadian Tribute to Human Rights, a monument that was visited by Mandela during a visit to Ottawa in 1998.

- n) The city council of Toronto renamed a stretch of University Avenue “Nelson Mandela Boulevard” in December 2014.

### **Italy**

- o) The City of Milan unveiled a mural commemorating Nelson Mandela on the boundary wall of the Fabbrica del Vapore museum in July 2014. The mural was created by the Italian street artists Ivan, Nais, Orticanoodles and PaoPao. It was funded by the City of Milan, the Government of South Africa, and energy company Building Energy. In March 2014, a stone inscribed with a dedication to Nelson Mandela was placed in the Garden of the Righteous Worldwide of Milan and a tree was planted.